



40 First Plaza Ctr NW, Suite 609
Albuquerque NM 87102
voice 505.764.9417
instate wats 800.451.1941
fax 844.270-1133
e-mail ccv@civicvalues.org
web www.civicvalues.org

February 12, 2019

2019 New Mexico High School Mock Trial Qualifier Scoring Error

Dear Teams, Coaches and Supporters:

During the second day of competition, there was an error in the scoring room. In that round, team FV (Volcano Vista Black or VV Black) and team KS (Albuquerque Academy Red or AA Red) faced each other. The ballots reflected a win for AA Red, but the numbers were accidentally transposed and the win inadvertently and incorrectly went to team VV Black. This error led to the teams being incorrectly power-matched against other teams. VV Black went on to lose Round 4 and AA Red went on to win Round 4. The error was discovered on the evening of February 9 – after the awards for the qualifier competition had been announced – and brought to the Center for Civic Values (CCV) Board’s attention the following day, February 10.

The CCV deeply regrets this error occurred, and the disappointment that has resulted. All of our volunteers work very hard to be as accurate as possible under serious time constraints, but the process involves a lot of moving parts, and mistakes do happen. The Board’s Rules Committee will convene after the state competition is held in order to develop a policy for addressing scoring errors in the future. In addition, the Board will work with the scoring room volunteers in order to determine whether a change in forms and/or processes would help to avoid these types of errors.

The Board convened and held a vote on February 11 to determine how to rectify this error. We knew going into the discussion that no option would be completely fair to the teams affected, and that in order to be as equitable as possible, the integrity of the competition rules should be upheld. As a result, the Board has decided to correct the rankings of VV Black and AA Red to reflect the actual scores they received in Round 3. This adjustment results in team FV moving from a 3-1 record to a 2-2 record, and team KS moving from a 3-1 record to a 4-0 record. In addition, the correction results in Albuquerque High’s Green team moving from 9th to 8th place, which advances the AHS Green team to the state competition.

The Board considered several other ways to remedy the error, including sending more teams to state competition, leaving the rankings as is despite the scoring error, and holding a “play-in” or qualifying round between VV Black and AHS Green in order to determine which team would advance to state. However, these options did not align with mock trial’s scoring rules and/or did not account for potential effects on other teams that did not qualify for state competition.

This decision was thoroughly discussed and considered, and was not approached lightly. We are sincerely and deeply sorry for the negative impact this has on the Volcano Vista students, coaches, families, and supporters, and we are striving to ensure this does not happen to any other team in the future.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Heather Jaramillo', written in a cursive style.

Heather Jaramillo
Vice Chair, Center for Civic Values

Center for Civic Values

Gene Franchini High School Mock Trial Competition

Qualifier Results-February 8-9, 2019

Ranking	Team	Code	W-L	Round 1			Round 2			Round 3			Round 4			Total		
				Opp	Bal	Pts	Opp	Bal	Pts	Opp	Bal	Pts	Opp	Bal	Pts	Bal	Pts	
1	Volcano Vista Platinum	YO	4.00	4-0	OM	3	293	TP	3	308	CX	3	304	QX	3	316	12	1221
2	Albuquerque Academy Black	EM	4.00	4-0	LY	3	289	KF	3	329	PC	2	294	FV	3	308	11	1220
3	Albuquerque Academy Red	KS	4.00	4-0	LK	3	269	MY	2	300	FV	3	301	PC	3	342	11	1212
4	Bosque Blue	MY	3.00	3-1	YM	3	276	KS	1	294	OH	3	297	LY	3	281	10	1148
5	Cottonwood Classical Gold	BD	3.00	3-1	LV	3	256	QX	1	260	YM	3	292	OM	3	318	10	1126
6	Santa Fe Gold	TP	3.00	3-1	GE	3	275	YO	0	288	TE	3	278	WC	3	293	9	1134
7	Albuquerque White	PB	3.00	3-1	YR	0	260	SG	3	279	ML	3	315	CX	3	275	9	1129
8	Albuquerque Green	QX	3.00	3-1	DN	3	311	BD	2	267	YR	3	318	YO	0	312	8	1208
9	Bosque White	YR	3.00	3-1	PB	3	278	ML	3	284	QX	0	279	KF	2	282	8	1123
10	Cleveland Blue	KT	2.00	2-2	BS	3	271	FV	0	242	WC	1	272	TE	3	314	7	1099
11	Amy Biehl Red	LK	2.00	2-2	KS	0	257	DN	3	270	KF	1	254	LV	3	288	7	1069
12	Pojoaque White	PC	2.00	2-2	OH	2	271	BYE	3	282	EM	1	273	KS	0	331	6	1157
13	Animas Green	ML	2.00	2-2	WC	3	283	YR	0	260	PB	0	287	AM	3	275	6	1105
14	Volcano Vista Black	FV	2.00	2-2	TE	3	294	KT	3	249	KS	0	283	EM	0	276	6	1102
15	Santa Fe Blue	KF	2.00	2-2	AM	3	275	EM	0	297	LK	2	264	YR	1	265	6	1101
16	Arrowhead Maroon	YM	2.00	2-2	MY	0	233	GE	3	271	BD	0	264	QY	3	268	6	1036
17	Cibola	WC	2.00	2-2	ML	0	278	BS	3	307	KT	2	284	TP	0	279	5	1148
18	Atrisco Heritage Academy White	CX	2.00	2-2	SG	3	278	QY	2	283	YO	0	267	PB	0	260	5	1088
19	Manzano	LY	2.00	2-2	EM	0	193	OH	2	242	BYE	3	289	MY	0	248	5	972
20	Bosque Green	OM	2.00	2-2	YO	0	229	AM	2	240	QY	2	280	BD	0	287	4	1036
21	Goddard White	GE	1.00	2-2	TP	0	233	YM	0	241	BS	3	264	BYE	3	288	6	1026
22	Sandia Prep	QY	1.00	1-3	BYE	3	281	CX	1	279	OM	1	261	YM	0	253	5	1074
23	Atrisco Heritage Academy Blue	OH	1.00	1-3	PC	1	248	LY	1	245	MY	0	227	DN	3	237	5	957
24	Amy Biehl Black	AM	1.00	1-3	KF	0	244	OM	1	227	DN	3	241	ML	0	249	4	961
25	Animas White	TE	1.00	1-3	FV	0	259	LV	3	280	TP	0	258	KT	0	306	3	1103
26	Arrowhead Gold	LV	1.00	1-3	BD	0	221	TE	0	273	SG	3	312	LK	0	265	3	1071
27	Cleveland	SG	1.00	1-3	CX	0	219	PB	0	224	LV	0	278	BS	3	238	3	959
28	Valley	BS	0.00	0-4	KT	0	216	WC	0	231	GE	0	251	SG	0	217	0	915
29	Atrisco Heritage Academy Green	DN	0.00	0-4	QX	0	225	LK	0	212	AM	0	219	OH	0	209	0	865

Teams 1 - 8 will advance to State Finals in March

Teams are ranked based upon Rule 5.5(b):

For the purpose of determining final rankings at the conclusion of regionals and state finals, teams shall be ranked based upon the following criteria in the order listed, provided that if by application of the criteria a team is ranked higher than a team with the same win/loss record that defeated it, the losing team shall be placed immediately below the winning team (i.e., a team cannot place above a team that defeated it, if both teams are in the same win-loss bracket):

1. win/loss record;
2. total number of ballots won;
3. total number of points awarded; and,
4. point spread against opponents (total points awarded minus total points awarded to opponents).